

Public Document Pack

Argyll and Bute Council
Comhairle Earra Ghaidheal agus Bhoid

Corporate Services
Director: Nigel Stewart



Kilmory, Lochgilphead, PA31 8RT
Tel: 01546 602127 Fax: 01546 604444
DX 599700 LOCHGILPHEAD
e.mail –nigel.stewart@argyll-bute.gov.uk

29 December 2009

SUPPLEMENTARY PACK

CHORD PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT BOARD – 6 JANUARY 2010

I enclose herewith item 4 (**CAMPBELTOWN ALL WEATHER PITCH FACILITY**) and item 6 (**INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF TENDERS FOR CHORD CONSULTANCY SERVICES FRAMEWORK AGREEMENT**) which were marked to follow on the above agenda.

Nigel Stewart
Director of Corporate Services

TO FOLLOW ITEMS

- 4. **CAMPBELTOWN ALL WEATHER PITCH FACILITY**
Report by Head of Facility Services (Pages 1 - 8)
- E1 6. **INITIAL ASSESSMENT OF TENDERS FOR CHORD CONSULTANCY SERVICES FRAMEWORK AGREEMENT**
Report by Head of Economic Development and Strategic Transportation (Pages 9 - 12)

The Committee will be asked to pass a resolution in terms of Section 50(A)(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 to exclude the public for items of business with an "E" on the grounds that it is likely to involve the disclosure of exempt information as defined in the appropriate paragraph of Part 1 of Schedule 7a to the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973.

The appropriate paragraphs are:-

- E1 **Paragraph 6** Information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (other than the authority).
- Paragraph 8** The amount of any expenditure proposed to be incurred by the authority under any particular contract for the acquisition of property or the supply of goods or services.

Paragraph 9 Any terms proposed or to be proposed by or to the authority in the course of negotiations for a contract for the acquisition or disposal of property or the supply of goods or services.

CHORD PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT BOARD

Councillor Dick Walsh (Chair)
George Harper
Nigel Stewart

Councillor Robert Macintyre
Sally Loudon
Bruce West

Contact: Fiona McCallum Tel: 01546 604406

ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL**CHORD PROGRAMME BOARD****Operational Services****6 January 2010**

Campbeltown All Weather Pitch – Outline Business Case

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Campbeltown is the only mainland town in Argyll & Bute without access to an All Weather Pitch (AWP) facility. An Outline Business Case (OBC) for the procurement of a new AWP was considered by the Council Executive in December 2007. Scope exists for the construction of a new All Weather Pitch to be either procured as the Community Facility element of the CHORD project, or within the scope of the replacement of the existing Grammar School.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 The Programme Board mandates the Head of Facility Services to undertake the development of an Outline Business Case which will identify the preferred option for the procurement of a new all weather pitch at either Kinloch Green, or at the Grammar School site.
- 2.2 The Head of Facility Services to prepare a Project Initiation Document (PID) which will set out the scope, process, timetable and resources required to undertake the OBC for consideration by the Campbeltown CHORD Project Board.

3. DETAIL

- 3.1 The OBC for a new All Weather Pitch was considered by the Council's Executive in December 2007. Extracts from the OBC are at Appendix 1. In qualitative terms the option to construct the proposed AWP at Kinloch Green scored marginally less than the preferred option at the Meadows Site. In terms of both capital construction cost and future operational revenue costs, the Kinloch Green Site was the strongest project option. The Executive's decision (December 2007) is at Appendix 2.
- 3.2 In 2008, a community consultation process was completed in South Kintyre by the South Kintyre Development Trust which identified the procurement of an All Weather Pitch in Campbeltown as the priority for the provision of new community facilities.

The condition of football pitches in Campbeltown (in poor weather conditions) often do not meet the requirements of the Scottish Amateur Football Association (SAFA). It is understood that local clubs have been threatened with expulsion from SAFA if the condition of football pitches and facilities does not improve.

The South Kintyre Sports Council convened a meeting between local members and Field Sports Groups in March 2009 to explore alternative site options and raise the profile of the issue of lack of all weather facilities. It is understood that the option of a site at the Grammar school is the least favoured site for the community in terms of deliverability, accessibility and future operational and management arrangements.

Following consideration of this paper by the Programme Board on 6 January 2010, a meeting has been arranged between Facility Services and **sportscotland** to discuss the development of the Council's Sports Facility Strategy, at which the proposed development of a new AWP in Campbeltown will be discussed. A further meeting is being convened in January between local stakeholders, the SFA, **sportscotland**, the Scottish Government and Council officers to explore how the procurement of a new All Weather Pitch can be progressed.

- 3.3 The Campbeltown CHORD project has established the procurement of an All Weather Pitch as an option for the Community Facility Element of the project. Appendix 3 refers.
- 3.4 The Head of Community Regeneration has confirmed that following the Executive's visit to the Campbeltown Grammar School in November 2009, Community Services have been asked to prepare a brief and Initial Business Case for its replacement. In line with the Executive's decision of December 2007, the IBC should include provision for the construction of an AWP.

The playing field currently used by Campbeltown Grammar School was identified within the OBC (2007) as a suitable site for the construction of an AWP; it has favourable ground conditions. Given the configuration of the Grammar School site and the associated ground conditions, it is reasonable to assume that the current playing field can be considered as the favoured site for the Grammar School rebuild option.

4. CONCLUSION

- 4.1 In terms of construction, the sites at Kinloch Green and the Grammar School are the only 2 viable sites in Campbeltown. Given that there is scope for the procurement of the new All Weather Pitch either as the Community Facility Element of the CHORD Project, or within the construction of a replacement Grammar School, both these delivery options should be subject to an Outline Business Case (OBC). The OBC will test each option in terms of Impact, Affordability, Deliverability and Risk and will expose any limitations or conditions in terms of Planning which apply to each site.

- 4.2 The development of the OBC has the advantage that it can build upon the original OBC undertaken in 2007. The Council's Playing Fields Project Manager who worked on the original OBC in 2007 has now retired. In order to undertake a competent OBC, appropriate resources will be required. The Head of Facility Services, if mandated, will prepare a Project Initiation Document (PID) which will set the scope, process, timetable and resources required to undertake the OBC. It is anticipated that Facility Services and Community Services will work together on the development of the OBC.

5.0 APPENDICES

Appendix 1	Extract from OBC (December 2007)
Appendix 2	Executive Minute & Decision (December 2007)
Appendix 3	Note from Councillor Semple (December 2009)

Sandy Mactaggart
Head of Facility Services

6 January 2010

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The proposed development of the all weather pitch on site B2 at the Meadows is the preferred option at this time. Although this is not the cheapest option (£332K more expensive than Site A1 adjacent to Aqualibrium on Kinloch Green), and recognising that the site has an inherent risk associated with the poor ground conditions at the Meadows, the Options Appraisal analysis identified it as the most suitable site. If the project is to proceed in Financial Year 2008/9, Option B2 will require the acceleration of £531K of capital funding from Future Years, an additional block allocation of £285K and a successful application for match funding of £260K from Sportscotland.

Although Site A1 at Kinloch Green and C1 at the Grammar School are significantly more affordable in terms of their capital construction cost, given the ongoing development of the Council's plans for its school estate and waterfront and town centre re-generation, there is a potential risk of a conflict of priorities if either the existing playing field site adjacent to Aqualibrium or the Grammar School site were selected.

Given the significant difference in capital construction costs between the different options, the Executive can either make a decision in December 2007 regarding the current preferred option outlined within this Outline Business Case (OBC), or consider the project at a later date when the direction of the school estate strategy and plans for the town centre waterfront and regeneration become clearer.

The OBC has identified that the future management of the proposed all weather pitch by the Leisure Service will make the operation of the proposed facility financially sustainable if the usage rates by local sporting groups, clubs and the community achieve half the demand identified by the Stakeholders. The Kinloch Green Site A1 provides particular operational benefits due to its proximity to Aqualibrium.

Proposed Site Options - Qualitative Evaluation Summary

Weighted Scores

No.	Option A1	Option A2	Option B1	Option B2	Option B3	Option C1	Option C2
1	3	3	225	225	225	3	225
2	45	45	3	3	3	3	3
3	45	45	3	3	3	3	3
4	1	1	3	3	3	0.5	2
5	1.2	1.2	24	24	3	0.6	1.8
6	4	4	32	32	32	24	24
7	0.6	0	1.5	1.5	1.8	0.9	0.6
8	25	2	1	1.5	1	3	0.5
9	24	24	4	4	32	16	0.8
10	25	25	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
11	1.6	1.6	1.2	1.2	0.8	1.6	0.8
12	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
13	4	4	32	32	32	4	32
14	2	0	6	6	0	3	2
15	3	3	225	225	1.5	3	1.5
Total	388	357	395	40	3245	331	27.35

The results of the evaluation showed that the Meadows sites at B1 and B2 score highest, as they both provide access to the existing changing facilities, are the favoured areas for the majority of stakeholders, are accessible by the Grammar School (with some limitations) and have the least planning risk.

Site A1 offers many benefits due to its town centre location, its proximity to Aqualibrium and to existing changing facilities on Kinloch Green. In terms of future operations, this is the most sustainable site, with obvious synergies with Aqualibrium and an associated reduction in operational costs. Site A1 was not favoured by the Stakeholders, with the Grammar School expressing particular concerns that travel time to and from the facility would limit its use. There is also a potential planning risk associated with Site A1.

In purely qualitative terms the Meadows sites at B1 and B2 are the preferred sites.

4.1 Capital Construction Cost Estimates

Capital construction costs have been estimated using Contractors' cost estimates and experience of recent tenders at Tarbert and Kirkmichael in 2007/8.

The capital costs are summarised in Table 4.1. The breakdown of the capital cost for each site is at Appendix 6.

Table 4.1

Site	Description	OA Score	Ground Conditions	Projected Cost Estimate	Match Funding from Sportscotland	Future Years	Shortfall
A1	Existing pitch adjacent to Aqualibrium	3 rd	2 nd	£744K	£260K	£531K	-£47K
A2	New site within Kinloch Green	4 th	2 nd	£801K	£260K	£531K	£10K
B1	Meadows	2 nd	4 th	£1122K	£260K	£531K	£331K
B2	Meadows	1 st	3 rd	£1076K	£260K	£531K	£285K
B3	Meadows	6 th	5 th	£1544K	£260K	£531K	£753K
C1	Campbeltown Grammar	5 th	1 st	£686K	£260K	£531K	-£105K
C2	South of Hospital	7 th	6 th	£2135K	£260K	£531K	£1344K

When comparing capital cost estimates against potential match funding from Sportscotland and the capital sum allocated against this project in Future Years, the Kinloch Green sites (A1 & A2) and the Campbeltown Grammar site (C1) are significantly cheaper than the other options due to their favourable ground conditions.

The full cost of these sites do not however take into account the requirement to provide changing facilities. The option to upgrade the existing changing pavilion at Kinloch Green, or to provide changing facilities within Campbeltown Grammar have not been costed.

4.2 Operational Business Plan

The Operational Business Plan is based upon the Leisure Service operating and managing the all weather pitch from Aqualibrium. The Leisure Service will utilise the TOREX Leisure Management system to administer all pitch bookings in Campbeltown, which will allow the community to book facilities out of office hours, at weekends, and in due course through the "on line" link to the Council's website. A direct benefit of the Leisure Service managing and administering pitch bookings will be its capacity to deploy staff to open/close the facility in the evenings and at weekends from staff rotas, without the requirement to pay premium overtime rates.

APPENDIX 2

Executive - Thursday, 20 December 2007 9:00 am

43. CAMPBELTOWN ALL WEATHER PITCH OUTLINE BUSINESS CASE

[View the reasons why item 43. is restricted](#)

Report by Head of Strategic Finance, Extract from Minutes of Mid Argyll, Kintyre and the Islands Area Committee of 5 December 2007 and Outline Business Case by Head of Facility Services

Minutes:

A report summarising the outcome of consideration of the Campbeltown All Weather Pitch Outline Business Case was considered along with a recommendation from Mid Argyll, Kintyre and the Islands Area Committee.

Decision

1. To agree that officer time should be made available to consider a community facility at site B2; and
2. If a community facility at site B2 is not feasible to agree that provision of an all weather pitch is referred for consideration as part of the proposals for Campbeltown schools brought forward through the school estate modernisation plans.

(Reference: Report by Head of Strategic Finance dated 10 December 2007, extract from Minutes of Mid Argyll, Kintyre and the Islands Area Committee of 5 December 2007 and Campbeltown Community Sports Pitch Outline Business Case dated December 2007, submitted)

APPENDIX 3

Note from Cllr Semple

From: Semple, John

Sent: 11 December 2009 15:56

To: MacTaggart, Sandy

Cc: Kelly, Donald (Councillor); Colville, Rory; Harper, George; Debnam, Nicola

Subject: Community Facility Kinloch Rd. Campbeltown CHORD Project Element

Dear Sandy,

I have discussed the community facility element of the Campbeltown CHORD project with Cllrs Colville and Kelly who are in agreement with me and we ask you to bring forward a paper to the Project Board meeting on the 6th Jan identifying the All Weather Pitch Proposal worked up earlier in the year as the Community Facility Element of the Campbeltown CHORD Project identifying how it will meet CHORD Priorities.

As you are aware we have exhausted our search for alternative locations elsewhere in Campbeltown and come back to the identified OBC preference of Kinloch Rd.

John Semple

Councillor for Ward 1 -South Kintyre

Third Sector Spokesperson

Telephone - 01586 553765

Mobile - 07554334944

john.semple@argyll-bute.gov.uk

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank